National Translation Mission (NTM)

Central Institute of Indian Languages, Mysore

Minutes of the Third Meeting of the Project Advisory Committee

The third meeting of the NTM Project Advisory Committee (PAC) was held on 9th August 2010 at 10:30 am in the committee room of the in the committee room of Sahitya Akademi, 35 Rabindra Bhavan Feroz Shah Road, New Delhi 110 001. The meeting was **chaired by Dr. Anita Bhatnagar Jain**, Joint Secretary (L), Department of Higher Education, MHRD. Following members attended it:

1. Prof. Bijay Kumar, Chairman, CSTT, New Delhi.
2. Dr. Agrahara Krishna Murthy, Secretary, Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi.
3. Prof. Karuna Sindhu Das, Vice Chancellor, Rabindra Bharati University.
4. Prof. S. Radhakrishnan, Head, Dept. of Translation Studies, Tamil University, Thanjavur, Tamil Nadu.
5. Prof. Vanamala Vishwanatha, former faculty, Dept. of English, Bangalore University, Bangalore, Karnataka.
6. Dr. Pradhan Gurudatta, Chairperson, Karnataka Anuvada Academy, Bangalore, Karnataka.
7. Dr. Zafar Iqbal Manhas, Secretary, J & K Academy of Art, Culture and Languages, Jammu and Kashmir.
8. Shri. Praveen Dev, formerly Commissioning Editor, Pearson Education Pvt. Ltd., Patparganj, Delhi.
9. Dr. R.M.K. Sinha, Professor, IIT, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh.
10. Prof. Prakash Patnaik, Head, Dept. of MIL, Delhi University, Delhi.
11. Dr. K. Satchidanandan, Former Secretary, Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi.
12. Dr. Manoj Pataria, National Council for Science & Technology Communication, Technology Bhavan, New Delhi.
13. Dr. Mini Krishnan, Oxford University Press, Oxford House, Chennai, Tamil Nadu.
14. Shri. Eno C. Panlook, Ekta Book House Pvt. Ltd., Siliguri, West Bengal.
15. Prof. Rajesh Sachdeva, Director I/C, CIIL (Member Secretary)
16. Prof. Aditi Mukherjee, Project Director, NTM.

The meeting was also attended by Dr. Srinivasacharya, Co-ordinator (Publications), NTM, CIIL, Mysore.

The following six PAC members could not attend the meeting:
1. Shri. S K Ray, AS&FA, MHRD
2. Shri. R P Sisodia, Director (Languages), MHRD
3. Prof. Jayati Ghosh, Professor, JNU, New Delhi & Member, National Knowledge Commission
4. Prof. Harish Trivedi, Professor of English, University of Delhi, Delhi.
5. Prof. A.M. Pathan, Vice-Chancellor, Central University of Karnataka, Karnataka.
6. Dr. Swarn Lata, Director and Head of the Department, TDIL, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, New Delhi.

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON

The Chairperson opened the meeting by welcoming the members. She asked the members about their opinion on the reports NTM had prepared. Since the material was voluminous, the Chairperson was of the opinion that one needed more time to comment on all the aspects. She then asked the Project Director to table the preliminary presentations. Further, the follow up

actions on the suggestions received in the second meeting of the Project Advisory Committee was presented before the members.

ON THE LEGAL AGREEMENTS:
The members made a few suggestions about certain terms and clauses in the draft agreements prepared by NTM. In the draft for Agreement with the General Editor, the term 'CRC' could be made conditional as it would only be for the print dictionaries. The phrase 'Associated Company of NTM' may also be irrelevant as NTM is only a Scheme under the Government. The members pointed out that in Schedule A of the draft, the terms and conditions related to the payment to the General Editor also needed some pruning.

Payment of advance in the draft for Agreement for Turn Key Projects should be revised, the members opined. It was reported that paying advance to translators and other parties is not a practice among the major publishers in the country. Handling defaulters becomes a major issue if advance is paid. The members suggested that NTM should avoid payment of advance as it would be difficult, particularly, for a government agency, to recover money from defaulters. Monthly payment or other options can be tried. NTM should make sure in the agreements that all the parties involved in the process should receive the payment they are due in the Turn Key projects.

The members agreed to a suggestion from the Chair that they can take about ten days to comment in detail on the drafts of the agreements.

ON SELECTION OF THE PUBLISHERS AND TRANSLATORS FOR NTM PROJECTS:
It was suggested by the members that NTM should first shortlist the number of publishers and translators according to their earlier performances. Preliminary sifting could be done on the basis of the past records of the contractors. NTM may proceed to enter into a particular type of agreement on case to case basis after studying the implications carefully.

ON HAVING LANGUAGE OFFICERS FOR NTM:
Analyzing past performances or getting information about the various players in the translation and publishing industry could be facilitated if NTM has a renowned personality from the field of translation or publication in charge of each language. If a senior person of high caliber looks after the affairs of each language, it will reduce the amount of ground work needed to be done by NTM as the language officer would become the channel of communication between NTM and the other parties.

ON THE INTERACTION WITH MACHINE TRANSLATION (MT) GROUPS:
It was agreed that NTM may have a pilot project of translating e-books with the aid of the six machine translation systems in the country. A translator's work bench may be created with the experience earned by interacting with the six systems. Since the project will be dealing with e-books, the translations may be published in the electronic form and not in the print form. The members suggested that each of the MT group getting involved in the project should be paid.

ON THE PREPARATION OF A MANUAL FOR TRANSLATION:
The members approved the idea of a workshop to be conducted for the preparation of a manual for translation. However, the members said that a timeline should be spelt out for the manual. Translation activities of NTM need not wait for the manual to be completed. The

role of the manual would be complimentary and of priority but not mandatory to the translation activities of NTM, the members opined.

ON KNOWLEDGE TEXTS TRANSLATIONS:
The members suggested that NTM should prepare a list of languages in which translations should be done in the first phase. The languages can be identified on the basis of the data received from University Grants Commission (UGC) on the medium of instruction. NTM can also add more languages identified through its survey which are widely used in higher education as medium of instruction or writing exam in various parts of the country. Rest of the languages can be taken in the next phase.

As for the number of books to be translated, NTM may increase them from two to five in each discipline. The Chair and the members approved the list of 30 books in 14 disciplines and the methodology adopted by NTM to shortlist those books. NTM can continue with the same methodology for selecting the remaining books. The list of books need not be placed before the PAC again. Approval of the Subcommittee on Knowledge Books to be Translated should be treated as final for their translations.

ON THE BOOKS TRANSLATED THROUGH NTM WORKSHOPS:
The books translated as part of the Workshops for Formulating Strategies of Translations in various disciplines and languages may be taken to the Subcommittee on Knowledge Texts to be Translated for approval after which NTM can publish them.

ON THE LIST OF TRANSLATORS:
Existing list of translators from the National Register of Translators(NRT) and other sources should be scrutinized first based on the previous translation experience and subject experience of the translators. Some of the members also agreed to pass on the list of translators available with them to NTM. The Mission may also use the names that it has received by contacting universities, institutions and agencies after applying the same scrutinization techniques.

ON THE INVOLVEMENT OF REGIONAL LANGUAGE CENTRES OF CIIL IN NTM ACTIVITIES:
NTM may prepare a list of people from the RLC's of CIIL who may be involved in NTM activities. The list should also describe their responsibilities vis a vis NTM. The Mission should try and give gender representation whenever such lists are prepared.

ACTION POINTS
1. Members of the PAC to send their comments on the drafts of the Agreements 20th of August.
2. NTM to launch a pilot project with the six machine translation systems in the country.
3. NTM to expand the list of books for translation from two to five in each discipline and get the approval for new books from the Subcommittee on Knowledge Texts to be Translated.
4. Books translated in NTM workshops to be taken to Subcommittee for approval.
5. Consolidated list of translators to be scrutinized, graded and pruned.